

# Homo Democraticus



# Homo Democraticus

On the Universal Desirability and the Not So Universal  
Possibility of Democracy and Human Rights

by

Filip Spagnoli



Cambridge Scholars Press Ltd.  
London

Homo Democraticus: On the Universal Desirability and the Not So Universal  
Possibility of Democracy and Human Rights  
by Filip Spagnoli

This book first published 2003 by

Cambridge Scholars Press

119 Station Road, Amersham, Buckinghamshire, HP7 0AH UK

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data  
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Copyright © Cambridge Scholars Press

All rights for this book reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the copyright owner.

ISBN 1-904303-26-9

## CONTENTS

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| Introduction   | 1         |
| § 1: The Anti-democrat's Paradox   | 2         |
| § 2: Why Do We Need Democracy and Human Rights?                                      | 4         |
| § 3: Anti-Foundationalism  | 8         |
| § 4: Why do Some People Reject Democracy and/or Human Rights?                        | 10        |
| § 5: Some Conflicts  | 13        |
| § 6: Rejecting Democracy and/or Human Rights Because They Are Not Possible Yet       | 17        |
| § 7: A Problem of Definition   | 18        |
| § 8: A Provisional Definition  | 23        |
| § 9: The Need for Democratic Imperialism   | 25        |
| § 10: A Short Description of the Purpose, the Content and the Structure of this Book | 26        |
| <br>   |           |
| Part One: Public Life, Political Life and Cultural Life                              | 29        |
| <br>   |           |
| <b>Chapter One: Freedom Rights Protect Public Life</b>                               | <b>30</b> |
| <br>   |           |
| Section One: The Importance of Public Life   | 30        |
| § 11: Important Values   | 30        |
| § 12: Why Do We Need a Public Life?  | 32        |
| § 13: Public and Private   | 39        |
| § 14: General and Particular   | 41        |
| § 15: General and Private Interest   | 42        |
| § 16: Equality   | 43        |
| § 17: Time   | 44        |

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| Section Two: The Protection of Public Life   | 46        |
| § 18: Free Speech, Freedom of Association and Freedom of Assembly                      | 46        |
| § 19: The Rule of Law and the Separation Between the State and Society (1)             | 48        |
| § 20: The Rule of Law, Difference, Identity and Criticism                              | 52        |
| § 21: Borders Between Concepts   | 54        |
| § 22: The Rule of Law Guarantees Publicity, Openness, Justice and Fairness             | 57        |
| § 23: Security   | 59        |
| § 24: No Human Rights Without Tolerance  | 65        |
| § 25: Tolerance Linked to Diversity as a Good  | 66        |
| § 26: Tolerating Intolerance? (1)  | 67        |
| § 27: Religious Liberty Promotes Openness, Disclosure, Pluralism, Tolerance and Debate | 70        |
| § 28: Limiting and Separating the State and the Church                                 | 71        |
| § 29: Different Sub-Communities With Different Identities Living Together              | 74        |
| § 30: The Historical Role of the Reformation   | 79        |
| § 31: The Private Space  | 81        |
| § 32: Private Property   | 82        |
| § 33: Equal Rights, Non-Discrimination and Justice                                     | 84        |
| <b>Chapter Two: Negative and Positive Rights</b>                                       | <b>90</b> |
| Section Three: Human Rights Against the State  | 90        |
| § 34: To Forbear and to Protect  | 90        |
| § 35: Human Rights Added to, Given to, or Given by the State                           | 95        |
| Section Four: Human Rights Against Fellow Humans                                       | 97        |
| § 36: Bourgeois Rights   | 97        |
| § 37: General Interest and Self-interest, and the Dangers of Both (1)                  | 99        |
| § 38: The Importance of Boundaries and of the Intimate and Inviolable Space            | 99        |
| § 39: Some Negative Consequences of Boundaries   | 101       |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>Chapter Three: Political Life, Version 1 (The Link Between Democracy and Human Rights)</b> | <b>103</b> |
| Section Five: Power Struggle and Struggle in Society, Version 1                               | 103        |
| § 40: Different Ways of Institutionalizing Conflict   | 103        |
| § 41: Exceptions to the Link Between Democracy and Human Rights?                              | 107        |
| § 42: The Right to Democracy and Political Rights   | 109        |
| § 43: Self-Control and Self-Government  | 110        |
| § 44: The Problem of Unanimity  | 111        |
| § 45: Democracy and the Rule of Law   | 116        |
| § 46: Change and Publicity  | 118        |
| Section Six: Control and Judgment on the Basis of Free Flows of Information                   | 121        |
| § 47: Power, Accountability and Openness in Two Directions                                    | 121        |
| § 48: Attentiveness, Involvement and Knowledge  | 123        |
| § 49: Obscurity and Manipulation  | 126        |
| Section Seven: The Construction of the Will of the People                                     | 128        |
| § 50: Human Rights and the Will of the People   | 128        |
| § 51: The Construction of Communities   | 129        |
| § 52: Setting the Agenda  | 132        |
| § 53: Democracy is a Goal and Not Just a Means (1)  | 133        |
| § 54: The Separation Between State and Society and Between State and Politics                 | 135        |
| <b>Chapter Four: Political Life, Version 2 (Direct and Indirect Participation)</b>            | <b>137</b> |
| Section Eight: Participation by Way of Representation   | 137        |
| § 55: Actors and Authors  | 137        |
| § 56: Historical Perspective  | 139        |
| § 57: Advantages of Representation: Purification and Clarity vs. Confusion and Vagueness      | 140        |
| § 58: Other Considerations  | 144        |
| Section Nine: Participation Without Representation  | 146        |
| § 59: Disadvantages of Representation   | 146        |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| § 60: Advantages of Direct Democracy; Democracy as a Goal and Not Just a Means (2)          | 150        |
| § 61: Different Forms of Direct Democracy and the Problem of the Leader                     | 152        |
| § 62: Disadvantages of Direct Democracy (1): Scale and Technology                           | 154        |
| § 63: Disadvantages of Direct Democracy (2): Scale and the Federal System                   | 156        |
| § 64: Disadvantages of Direct Democracy (3): Other Solutions to the Problem of Scale        | 161        |
| § 65: Disadvantages of Direct Democracy (4): Demagoguery and Emotionality                   | 163        |
| § 66: Disadvantages of Direct Democracy (5): Apathy and Stupidity                           | 165        |
| § 67: Disadvantages of Direct Democracy (6): Insufficient Resources to Participate          | 169        |
| § 68: Participation as a Goal in Itself   | 172        |
| § 69: The Separation Between State and Society (2)  | 173        |
| <b>Chapter Five: Humanity (Universality Because of Equality)</b>                            | <b>176</b> |
| Section Ten: Equal Values   | 176        |
| § 70: Natural Rights  | 176        |
| § 71: The Right to Belong to Humanity   | 178        |
| Section Eleven: Legal Rights  | 180        |
| § 72: The Legal Person  | 180        |
| § 73: Positivism  | 182        |
| § 74: The Exception of Political Rights   | 184        |
| § 75: The Right to Citizenship and the Right to Asylum                                      | 187        |
| § 76: Humanity and the People   | 190        |
| <b>Chapter Six: Culture (Non-Universality Because of Inequality)</b>                        | <b>193</b> |
| Section Twelve: The Impossibility and the Undesirability of Democracy and Rights, Version 1 | 193        |
| § 77: Undesirable   | 193        |
| § 78: Impossible  | 195        |
| § 79: A-Cultural Rights   | 196        |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| § 80: Who Criticizes Rights and Democracy?   | 199 |
| § 81: Is the Identity a Goal or a Means?   | 200 |
| § 82: Identity is both a Myth and a Problem  | 202 |
| § 83: Contradictions in the Ideology of Culture and Identity                               | 203 |
| § 84: The Right of States and Individuals to Criticize                                     | 205 |
| § 85: The Only and Almighty Authority of Culture   | 206 |
| § 86: Cultural Relativism and (Neo)Colonialism   | 207 |
| § 87: Western Rights   | 208 |
| § 88: The Radical Rejection of Democracy and the “I-Did-It-My-<br>Way” Syndrome            | 211 |
| § 89: Rights Limited to the West are Only Semi-Rights                                      | 213 |
| § 90: Origin and Effect  | 215 |
| Section Thirteen: Real Diversity   | 216 |
| § 91: “Popular” or Truly Cultural Rejection of Human Rights and<br>the Limits of Identity  | 216 |
| § 92: The Relativity of Relativism   | 217 |
| § 93: Changing Cultures  | 220 |
| § 94: Tolerating Intolerance? (2)  | 223 |
| § 95: Culture and the Individual   | 224 |
| § 96: Universalizing Human Rights is not the Same Thing as<br>Universalizing Individualism | 226 |
| § 97: Rights and Community   | 228 |
| Section Fourteen: Collective Rights  | 233 |
| § 98: Superfluous Rights   | 233 |
| § 99: The Right to a State and the Right to Identity                                       | 234 |
| § 100: Dangerous Rights  | 236 |
| § 101: Special Minority Rights   | 239 |
| Section Fifteen: Real and Normative Universality   | 241 |
| § 102: Universality at the level of States   | 241 |
| § 103: Universality at the level of the People (A Minimal<br>Consensus or “Weltethos”)     | 243 |
| § 104: An Intercultural Dialogue   | 244 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Part Two: The Economy  | 247 |
| <b>Chapter Seven: Economic Development</b>   | 248 |
| Section Sixteen: From Economic Development to Democracy and Rights (The Impossibility and the Undesirability of Democracy and Rights, Version 2) | 248 |
| § 105: Economic Prerequisites  | 248 |
| § 106: Economic Development as a Cause of Democracy and Human Rights   | 249 |
| Section Seventeen: From Democracy and Rights to Economic Development   | 253 |
| § 107: Democracy and Human Rights as a Cause of Economic Development   | 253 |
| § 108: The Choice Between Hunger and Oppression  | 255 |
| § 109: Hunger and Oppression Go Together   | 258 |
| § 110: A New Inversion of Means and Ends (1)   | 260 |
| § 111: The Link Between Identity and the Economy   | 261 |
| § 112: A New Inversion of Means and Ends (2)   | 262 |
| <b>Chapter Eight: Economic Rights</b>  | 264 |
| Section Eighteen: Why Do We Need Economic Rights?  | 264 |
| § 113: A Necessary Minimum and Not a Possible Maximum  | 264 |
| § 114: In Everybody's Interest   | 266 |
| § 115: A Hierarchy of Rights?  | 267 |
| § 116: Urgency vs. Synchronicity   | 269 |
| § 117: Private Life as a Prerequisite for Public and Political Life  | 269 |
| § 118: Humanity  | 271 |
| § 119: Universality Because of Equality (2) and Equality as an Excuse  | 271 |
| § 120: Insufficient Conditions   | 273 |
| Section Nineteen: How Do We Promote Economic Rights?   | 274 |
| § 121: Public and Political Life as a Prerequisite for Private Life  | 274 |
| § 122: Catch 22?   | 275 |
| § 123: The Hierarchy of Responsibility, Duty, Assistance and   | 276 |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| Redistribution   | 274        |
| § 124: Enforcement, Resources and the Long Term  | 279        |
| § 125: The Right to Property and the Right to the Property of<br>Someone Else                    | 283        |
| <b>Part Three: Peace</b>   | <b>287</b> |
| <b>Chapter Nine: Peace Between States</b>  | <b>288</b> |
| Section Twenty: Self-determination, Version 1  | 288        |
| § 126: Self-determination: A Human Right and a Right of a State                                  | 288        |
| § 127: A Necessary Condition and an Unnecessary Obstacle at the<br>Same Time                     | 290        |
| § 128: Realism and Moralism (International Peace, Rights and<br>Democracy)                       | 292        |
| § 129: A Consistent System of Rights   | 293        |
| Section Twenty-One: Other Ways in Which Rights and<br>Democracy Protect the Peace Between States | 295        |
| § 130: Agreements, Publicity and Popular Support   | 295        |
| § 131: The Real Importance of Peace  | 297        |
| § 132: Napoleontism and Neo-Colonialism  | 298        |
| § 133: The Paradox of Democracy  | 301        |
| <b>Chapter Ten: Peace Inside a State</b>   | <b>307</b> |
| Section Twenty-Two: Self-Determination, Version 2  | 307        |
| § 134: Self-Determination of a People  | 307        |
| § 135: Revolution or Separation  | 308        |
| § 136: Borders as an End or as a Problem   | 310        |
| Section Twenty-Three: National Unity   | 313        |
| § 137: Democracy is Impossible and Necessary at the Same Time<br>(1)                             | 313        |
| § 138: How to Create Unity and Avoid Discord?  | 317        |
| § 139: Pacification-Democracy  | 319        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| Part Four: Equality  | 323        |
| <b>Chapter Eleven: The Value of Equality</b>   | <b>324</b> |
| Section Twenty-Four: Democracy Produces the Best Decisions                                   | 324        |
| § 140: Why Do We Need Equality?  | 324        |
| § 141: The Epistemological Advantages of Democracy   | 327        |
| § 142: Democracy is Not Necessarily Relativistic, Nihilistic or Amoral                       | 329        |
| Section Twenty-Five: Truth vs. Opinion   | 331        |
| § 143: The Absence of Truth  | 331        |
| § 144: A Good Content and a Good Procedure   | 334        |
| § 145: The Possibility of Contestation   | 336        |
| § 146: Procedures are Not Enough   | 338        |
| <b>Chapter Twelve: Some Problems With Equality</b>   | <b>340</b> |
| Section Twenty-Six: Equal or Unequal Value and a Problem of Definition                       | 340        |
| § 147: The Value of a Human Being  | 340        |
| § 148: Unequal Value   | 342        |
| § 149: The Combination of Equal and Unequal Value  | 343        |
| § 150: A Problem of Definition   | 345        |
| § 151: Equality Before the Law vs. Material Equality   | 348        |
| § 152: Equality of Outcome vs. Equality of Procedures  | 349        |
| § 153: Political Equality vs. Material Equality  | 351        |
| Section Twenty-Seven: Efficiency, the Ability to Take Decisions, and the Quest for Consensus | 355        |
| § 154: Confusion, Chaos, Complexity, Slowness and Insecurity                                 | 355        |
| § 155: Consensus   | 358        |
| § 156: Dangerous Truth (The Truth Threatens Politics)  | 359        |
| § 157: Reasonableness Instead of Truth   | 363        |
| § 158: Democracy is Impossible and Necessary at the Same Time (2) (Unity of Vision)          | 370        |
| § 159: Creating Consensus  | 373        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| Section Twenty-Eight: Efficiency, the Ability to Take Decisions<br>and to Execute the Will of the People | 378        |
| § 160: Disadvantages of a Multi-Party System   | 378        |
| § 161: Advantages of a Two-Party System  | 382        |
| § 162: Disadvantages of a Two-Party System   | 383        |
| § 163: Vote Buying   | 384        |
| § 164: General Interest and Self-Interest, and the Dangers of Both<br>(2)                                | 387        |
| Section Twenty-Nine: Big Government  | 391        |
| § 165: Causes  | 391        |
| § 166: Elements Working Against  | 395        |
| § 167: Transnational Democracy   | 397        |
| <b>Part Five: Freedom</b>  | <b>401</b> |
| <b>Chapter Thirteen: Autonomy and Self-Realization</b>   | <b>402</b> |
| Section Thirty: Autonomy or the Freedom to Choose Your Own<br>Good Life                                  | 402        |
| § 168: The Importance of Freedom and the Link With Democracy<br>and Rights                               | 402        |
| § 169: Some Problems With Autonomy   | 408        |
| § 170: Widening Autonomy   | 411        |
| § 171: Autonomy and the Economy  | 414        |
| Section Thirty-One: Self-Realization and the Only True Good Life   | 417        |
| § 172: Forcing People to Make the Best of Themselves   | 417        |
| § 173: An Anti-Democratic Definition of Freedom?   | 420        |
| <b>Chapter Fourteen: Freedom and Obedience</b>   | <b>425</b> |
| Section Thirty-Two: Unlimited and Limited Freedom  | 425        |
| § 174: Obedience to Yourself (The Law as an Extension of<br>Yourself)                                    | 425        |
| § 175: Freedom and the State (Anarchism and Liberalism)  | 428        |
| § 176: Limited, Legal and Equal Coercion (Freedom and Equality)  | 433        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| Section Thirty-Three: Limited Freedom is Anti-Social   | 439        |
| § 177: Our Freedom is Limited by the Harm We Can Inflict on<br>Other People  | 439        |
| § 178: The Value of Our Fellow Men   | 441        |
| § 179: Negative and Positive Freedom   | 443        |
| <b>Chapter Fifteen: The Choice Between Freedom and the Dictator-<br/>ship of the Majority, or Between Rights and Democracy</b> | <b>446</b> |
| Section Thirty-Four: Power Struggle and Struggle in Society,<br>Version 2  | 446        |
| § 180: A Separation of Independent Powers  | 446        |
| § 181: Limited Independence  | 448        |
| § 182: A Democratic Court of Justice?  | 451        |
| § 183: Power Struggle and Struggle in General  | 452        |
| § 184: Separation Inside the Different Powers  | 452        |
| § 185: Separation of Powers in a Federal System  | 453        |
| Section Thirty-Five: The Rule of Law is Limited by Equality<br>Before the Law  | 454        |
| § 186: A Law Must be General, Anonymous and Neutral  | 454        |
| § 187: The Balance Between Political Rights and Freedom Rights   | 459        |
| § 188: Do Human Rights and the Law Limit Democracy?  | 459        |
| § 189: The Minority Protected by the Federal System  | 461        |
| <b>Concluding Remarks: Universality, Flexibility and Contextuality</b>   | <b>463</b> |
| § 190: Universality vs. Uniformity   | 464        |
| § 191: Rights and Wrongs, and Different Perspectives in the<br>Drafting of Laws  | 464        |
| § 192: A Different Application of Something Universal (Limits on<br>Human Rights)  | 467        |
| List of Human Rights and International Standards   | 471        |
| Bibliography   | 512        |
| Index  | 521        |

## ILLUSTRATIONS

|   |    |
|---|----|
| One: The Link Between Rights and Values | 31 |
| Two: Different Spaces                   | 55 |

## TABLES

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| One: The Hierarchy of Duties and Responsibilities | 283 |
| Two: The Combination of Equal and Unequal Value   | 344 |
| Three: Freedom and Equality                       | 437 |